

World Heritage Impact Assessment Cultural Heritage



Duncan Marshall - ICOMOS - 2009

Overview

- Impact assessment - World Heritage and other heritage
- EIA and heritage
- Impact assessment steps
- Key principles/issues
- Case studies



Key messages

- World Heritage impact assessment = good general heritage impact assessment
- Environmental impact assessment not quite the same as heritage impact assessment
- Impact assessment should be undertaken by relevant experts
- Impact assessment should be based on heritage values

Key messages

- Good impact assessment = independent impact assessment



Impact Assessment

- Retrospective impact assessment = monitoring
- Prospective impact assessment = EIA/HIA/CIA...



World Heritage - other heritage

- In practice there is nothing special or different about World Heritage impact assessment
- Good heritage impact assessment is basically the same for World Heritage and other levels of heritage





World Heritage - other heritage

- But... OUV = value + integrity + authenticity + protection + management
- So theoretically impact assessment for OUV could/should include integrity, authenticity, protection and management

Environment - Heritage

- Environment impact assessment is not quite the same as heritage impact assessment
- Principles are the same... but...
- In practice they are quite different - at least in some jurisdictions (eg. mindset, experts used, scale/threshold of impact)





Impact Assessment Steps

- Step 1. Develop an effective Public Involvement Plan, so that all affected interests will be involved
- Step 2. Describe the Proposed Action or Policy Change and Reasonable Alternatives
- Step 3. Define Baseline Conditions
- Step 4. Identify and Define the Significant Impacts

Impact Assessment Steps

- Step 5. Investigate the Significant Probable Impacts
- Step 6. Predict the Response of the Affected Communities to the Anticipated Impacts
- Step 7. Consider Indirect and Cumulative Impacts
- Step 8. Recommend new Alternatives as needed and feasible

Impact Assessment Steps

- Step 9. Develop a Mitigation Plan
- Step 10. Develop a Monitoring Plan and Program



(Sagnia 2004)

Expert Assessments

- Heritage impact assessment must be undertaken by experts
- And the right experts... experts in the heritage to be affected



Impact Assessment Steps

- Step 1. Develop an effective Public Involvement Plan, so that all affected interests will be involved
- Step 2. Describe the Proposed Action or Policy Change and Reasonable Alternatives
- Step 3. Define Baseline Conditions ←
- Step 4. Identify and Define the Significant Impacts ←

Values-based Assessment

- Heritage impact assessment must assess the impact on the heritage values of the place
- Need a clear understanding of the heritage values... all heritage values including World Heritage
- Assessment against values, attributes and policies...

Values-based Assessment

Value	Why a place is important	Impact?
Attribute	The thing that embodies the value (tangible/intangible)	Impact?
Policy	A general management statement to achieve conservation of the value (see also conservation charters)	Impact?



Values-based Assessment

Value	A masterpiece of 20th century architecture... its significance is based on its unparalleled design... a great urban sculpture	Impact?
Attribute	Original architectural design and sculptural form	Impact?
Policy	Conserve the architectural design and sculptural form	Impact?

Values-based Assessment

- Remember the whole place!
- Don't lose sight of the whole place while thinking about the small parts





Impact Assessment Measures

Absolute Measures	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Keep the Eiffel Tower (Yes/No?)
Quantitative Measures	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Keep the Gassho Houses in Shirakawa (All/Some/None?)
Qualitative Measures	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Conserve the Eiffel Tower• Conserve the traditional lifestyle related to the Gassho Houses• Conserve the setting of the Taj Mahal

Impact Assessment Measures

- Absolute and quantitative measures → Non-specialist assessment... maybe
- Qualitative measures → Expert assessment

Nature and Level of Impact

- Adverse/beneficial/neutral impact
- No/Low/Moderate/High impact
- Difficult decisions/no hard science
- Consequences depend on level of impact
- Consequences not always automatic
- Conservation should be an imperative irrespective of the level of impact











Impact Assessment Steps

- Step 1. Develop an effective Public Involvement Plan, so that all affected interests will be involved
- Step 2. Describe the Proposed Action or Policy Change and Reasonable Alternatives
- Step 3. Define Baseline Conditions
- Step 4. Identify and Define the Significant Impacts ←

Impact Assessment Steps

- Step 5. Investigate the Significant Probable Impacts
- Step 6. Predict the Response of the Affected Communities to the Anticipated Impacts
- Step 7. Consider Indirect and Cumulative Impacts ←
- Step 8. Recommend new Alternatives as needed and feasible

Cumulative Impacts

- Difficult!
- Predict future changes → planning
- Be worried about small changes
- Adopt a precautionary approach
- Deal with whole proposals













Independent Assessments

- The best assessments are undertaken independent of the proponent/manager
- In practice... many assessments are commissioned by the proponent/manager
- Ideally... assessments would be commissioned by a neutral party and paid for by the proponent/manager

Your Case Studies

- Identify one good case and one bad case
- Name of place/site/monument/property affected (preferably World Heritage)
- Nature of impact (one sentence)
- Key impact assessment lessons (dot points)

Key messages

- World Heritage impact assessment = good general heritage impact assessment
- Environmental impact assessment not quite the same as heritage impact assessment
- Impact assessment should be undertaken by relevant experts
- Impact assessment should be based on heritage values

Key messages

- Good impact assessment = independent impact assessment






