World Heritage Impact Assessment
Cultural Heritage

Duncan Marshall - ICOMOS - 2009

Overview
• Impact assessment - World Heritage and other heritage
• EIA and heritage
• Impact assessment steps
• Key principles/issues
• Case studies

Key messages
• World Heritage impact assessment = good general heritage impact assessment
• Environmental impact assessment not quite the same as heritage impact assessment
• Impact assessment should be undertaken by relevant experts
• Impact assessment should be based on heritage values
**Key messages**

- Good impact assessment = independent impact assessment

**Impact Assessment**

- Retrospective impact assessment = monitoring
- Prospective impact assessment = EIA/HIA/CIA...

**World Heritage - other heritage**

- In practice there is nothing special or different about World Heritage impact assessment
- Good heritage impact assessment is basically the same for World Heritage and other levels of heritage
World Heritage - other heritage

- But... OUV = value + integrity + authenticity + protection + management
- So theoretically impact assessment for OUV could/should include integrity, authenticity, protection and management
Environment - Heritage

- Environment impact assessment is not quite the same as heritage impact assessment
- Principles are the same... but...
- In practice they are quite different - at least in some jurisdictions (e.g. mindset, experts used, scale/threshold of impact)
Impact Assessment Steps

- Step 1. Develop an effective Public Involvement Plan, so that all affected interests will be involved
- Step 2. Describe the Proposed Action or Policy Change and Reasonable Alternatives
- Step 3. Define Baseline Conditions
- Step 4. Identify and Define the Significant Impacts
- Step 5. Investigate the Significant Probable Impacts
- Step 6. Predict the Response of the Affected Communities to the Anticipated Impacts
- Step 7. Consider Indirect and Cumulative Impacts
- Step 8. Recommend new Alternatives as needed and feasible
- Step 9. Develop a Mitigation Plan
- Step 10. Develop a Monitoring Plan and Program

(Sagnia 2004)
Expert Assessments

- Heritage impact assessment must be undertaken by experts
- And the right experts... experts in the heritage to be affected

Impact Assessment Steps

- Step 1. Develop an effective Public Involvement Plan, so that all affected interests will be involved
- Step 2. Describe the Proposed Action or Policy Change and Reasonable Alternatives
- Step 3. Define Baseline Conditions
- Step 4. Identify and Define the Significant Impacts

Values-based Assessment

- Heritage impact assessment must assess the impact on the heritage values of the place
- Need a clear understanding of the heritage values... all heritage values including World Heritage
- Assessment against values, attributes and policies...
### Values-based Assessment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Why a place is important</th>
<th>Impact?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Attribute</td>
<td>The thing that embodies the value (tangible/intangible)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy</td>
<td>A general management statement to achieve conservation of the value (see also conservation charters)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Example:* Values-based Assessment

- **Value:** A masterpiece of 20th century architecture... its significance is based on its unparalleled design... a great urban sculpture

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>Policy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Original architectural design and sculptural form</td>
<td>Conserve the architectural design and sculptural form</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Values-based Assessment

- Remember the whole place!
- Don’t lose sight of the whole place while thinking about the small parts

Impact Assessment Measures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Absolute Measures</th>
<th>Quantitative Measures</th>
<th>Qualitative Measures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • Keep the Eiffel Tower (Yes/No?) | • Keep the Gassho Houses in Shirakawa (All/Some/None?) | • Conserve the Eiffel Tower  
• Conserve the traditional lifestyle related to the Gassho Houses  
• Conserve the setting of the Taj Mahal |
**Impact Assessment Measures**

- Absolute and quantitative measures
  - Non-specialist assessment... maybe
- Qualitative measures
  - Expert assessment

**Nature and Level of Impact**

- Adverse/beneficial/neutral impact
- No/Low/Moderate/High impact
- Difficult decisions/no hard science
- Consequences depend on level of impact
- Consequences not always automatic
- Conservation should be an imperative irrespective of the level of impact
Impact Assessment Steps

- Step 1. Develop an effective Public Involvement Plan, so that all affected interests will be involved
- Step 2. Describe the Proposed Action or Policy Change and Reasonable Alternatives
- Step 3. Define Baseline Conditions
- Step 4. Identify and Define the Significant Impacts
- Step 5. Investigate the Significant Probable Impacts
- Step 6. Predict the Response of the Affected Communities to the Anticipated Impacts
- Step 7. Consider Indirect and Cumulative Impacts
- Step 8. Recommend new Alternatives as needed and feasible
Cumulative Impacts

- Difficult!
- Predict future changes ➔ planning
- Be worried about small changes
- Adopt a precautionary approach
- Deal with whole proposals
Independent Assessments

- The best assessments are undertaken independent of the proponent/manager
- In practice, many assessments are commissioned by the proponent/manager
- Ideally, assessments would be commissioned by a neutral party and paid for by the proponent/manager

Your Case Studies

- Identify one good case and one bad case
- Name of place/site/monument/property affected (preferably World Heritage)
- Nature of impact (one sentence)
- Key impact assessment lessons (dot points)
Key messages

- World Heritage impact assessment = good general heritage impact assessment
- Environmental impact assessment not quite the same as heritage impact assessment
- Impact assessment should be undertaken by relevant experts
- Impact assessment should be based on heritage values

---

Key messages

- Good impact assessment = independent impact assessment

---

---